

2018 Meeting Minutes

Members present: Josh Vandermeulen (Chair) [JDV], Blake Mann [BAM], Paul Pratt [PDP], Amanda Guercio [ACG], Barbara Charlton (voting member and assistant secretary) [BNC], Donald Sutherland [DAS], Bill Lamond [WGL], Ken Burrell (assistant Secretary) [KGB]

Absent: Mike Burrell (Secretary) [called in twice throughout meeting] [MVAB]

Agenda:

1. Call to Order – JDV called meeting to order at 0900
2. Minutes of the 2017 OBRC AGM: No comments/changes arising. Josh: motion to approve. Vote: 7-0 in favour.
3. Business arising from 2017 AGM:
 - a. No issues carried forward from 2017 AGM
4. Third round voting: discussion
 - a. 2018-021 Eurasian Collared-Dove
 - i. Consensus appears to be suspect; regularly kept in captivity. People heard the birds; species could have been present for a while. None looked like African Collared-Dove. Species is rapidly expanding, may be colonizing the province now. Eastern forests appear to have slowed their spread to Ontario. Vote: 6-1.
 - b. 2018-023 Eurasian Collared-Dove
 - i. Looks close to 'normal' looking EUCD. Looks similar to birds in Florida. Vote: 7-0
 - c. 2018-028 Eurasian Collared-Dove
 - i. Looks good, minus the under-tail web-patterning, which is highly variable. Vote: 7-0
 - d. 2019-029 Eurasian Collared-Dove
 - i. Only one photo; but nothing at odds with the ID. Vote: 7-0
 - e. 2019-030 Eurasian Collared Dove
 - i. Pale wing colouring but within range of variation. Location is suggestive of a 'good' vagrant. Vote: 6-1
 - f. 2018-032 Eurasian Wigeon
 - i. Originally voted no and is maintaining that – there is no description noted; unsure of how you could accept this record. Likely a EUWI but not enough details. BNC: no notes taken on the bird; there is no description. Evidence provided is moot. PP: don't doubt the identification, just no details provided. Vote: 0-7
 - g. 2018-071 Townsend's Warbler
 - i. JDV: overview of voting. Description sounds compelling. DAS: sketch is not very good. Not enough details to support identification. WGL: could be a good record but not enough details. Vote: 2-5
 - h. 2018-073 Western Sandpiper (Mitchell)

- i. JDV: overview of voting. Species has a long migration window of observations in Ontario. DAS: strong written description to make case for ID of species is very challenging. Over-reported species in Ontario. PP: very rare in Ontario. Long-billed female SESA's can be. WGL: description is not a SESA. WRSA? Are people hung-up on size? BAM: been tripped up on SESAs before: Vote: 2-5
 - i. 2018-074 Western Sandpiper (Blenheim)
 - i. DAS: outside expert opinion supports SESA. BAM: observer was not entirely sure of identification. JDV: WESA have much earlier pre-basic moult; bird should be in basic plumage. Vote: 0-7
 - j. 2018-139 Eastern Willet
 - i. BNC: not enough information known on sub-species identification. Brandon Holden agreed with P. Burke's overview that subspecies should have morphometrics and voice taken. Outside expert opinion was not supportive of Eastern claim. JDV: very interesting looking bird. DAS will look at records of Eastern Willet and solicit more information from outside expert opinions and provide information to Committee for potentially resubmitting. Vote: 2-5
- 5. Member motion to re-review records:
 - a. 2018-080 Wood Stork
 - i. Motion put forward by JDV to review the record.
 - ii. JDV: would constitute only the second spring record for Ontario. Did not adequately eliminate AWPE; only thoughts are tail. For a rarity of this magnitude, there is very little supporting documentation. WGL: bird was very close to observer.
 - iii. Vote to be re-reviewed for next year: 7-0. Motion passed. Record will be re-reviewed by 2019 committee.
 - b. 2018-048 Swallow-tailed Kite
 - i. PDP proposed record for review.
 - ii. PDP: doesn't think record is adequately documented.
 - iii. DAS: details of the observation aren't supportive/great.
 - iv. Vote to be re-reviewed for next year: 5-1-1 (WGL voted no, BNC abstained). Motion passed. Record will be re-reviewed by 2019 committee.
- 6. Motions to add/remove species from South Review list:
 - a. Ken: motion to remove Eurasian Collared-Dove
 - i. KGB: presented list of 23 accepted records (plus 3 unreviewed, 3 insufficient evidence) in the past five years. Noted that of the 3 insufficient evidence, 2 would now pass on updated thinking on the species.
 - ii. Meets threshold of OBRC's guideline (20 in five years). 23 records accepted by OBRC over past 5 years.
 - iii. Vote: 8-0 in favour of removing. Motion passed.
 - b. Ken: motion to remove White-winged Dove

- i. KGB: presented list of 18 accepted records (plus 4 unreviewed) in the past five years.
 - ii. Meets threshold of OBRC's guideline (20 in five years).
 - iii. Still a very rare bird, however, one of the species showing the clearest trend of increasing vagrancy in southern Ontario (44 of 47 in southern Ontario have been since year 2000).
 - iv. Must take into account that the returning Rondeau bird counts as a separate record each year.
 - v. Vote: 5-3 in favour of removing (WGL, DAS, and ?? voted no). Motion passed.
- 7. Motions to add/remove species from Central Review List:
 - a. Ken: motion to remove Eurasian Collared-Dove
 - i. KGB: Presented list of 10 accepted records in the past five years.
 - ii. Meets threshold for removal according to OBRC bylaws (10 records in past five years).
 - iii. Common adjacent to northwestern Ontario.
 - iv. Vote: 8-0 in favour of removing. Motion passed.
 - b. Ken: motion to remove White-winged Dove
 - i. KGB: Presented list of 12 accepted (plus 2 unreviewed) records in the past five years.
 - ii. Meets guideline for removal for Central (10 records in past five years).
 - iii. Quite amazing that the species is showing up so regularly, especially when one considers observer effort.
 - iv. Vote: 8-0 in favour of removing. Motion passed.
 - c. Ken: motion to remove Willet
 - i. KGB: Presented list of 7 accepted (plus 3 unreviewed) records in the past five years.
 - ii. Meets guideline for removal for Central (10 records in past five years).
 - iii. Common adjacent to this review zone (especially in adjacent Minnesota/Manitoba).
 - iv. Vote: 1-7 in favour of removing (MVB voted yes). Motion failed.
- 8. Updates to Bylaws: Mike proposed changing some of the text in the bylaws
 - a. Overview of the roles of Secretary, Chair, Members, as well as possible new position as Archivist:
 - b. Proposed changes to voting members duties (Section 3.3.4), per MVAB tracked changes (within the Bylaws):
 - 1. *3.3.4 Duties:*
 - 2. *3.3.4.1 Vote on all records within the timelines agreed upon by the Secretary and Chair,*
 - 3. *3.3.4.2 Gather background information/expert outside opinion for records under the direction of the Secretary or Chair*
 - 4. *3.3.4.3 Complete other tasks, as assigned by the Chair*
 - ii. Motion to accept: 7-0. Amendments passed.

- c. Proposed changes to the Secretary Duties (Section 3.5.4), per MVAB tracked changes (within the Bylaws)
 - 1. [remove] 3.4.4.8
 - 2. [add] new 3.4.4.8
 - a. *Prepare annual report with input from all other Committee members*
 - ii. Motion to accept: 7-0. Amendments passed.
 - d. Proposed changes to Chair Duties (Section 3.5.4), per MVAB tracked changes (within the Bylaws)
 - i. Motion to accept: 7-0. Amendments passed.
 - e. Proposed new position: Archivist (Section 3.7), per MVAB tracked changes (within the Bylaws)
 - i. Caveat that the position does not have to be filled every year
 - 1. Wording to include:
 - a. "In the absence of this position being filled, the duties of the Archivist will fall to the Secretary and/or Chair." [line 3.7.3.5]
 - ii. Motion to accept: 7-0. Amendments passed.
9. Division of letters of review for insufficient evidence records among voting members
- i. Members to send their letters back to Chair, who will then send out the letters formally, ahead of the Annual Report in the August issue of Ontario Birds. Aiming for late April.
 - b. 2018-032 Eurasian Wigeon – JDV
 - c. 2018-071 Townsend's Warbler – BAM
 - d. 2018-073 Western Sandpiper – PDP
 - e. 2018-073 Western Sandpiper – BNC
 - f. 2018-139 Eastern Willet - DAS
 - g. 2018-001 Chuck-will's Widow – BNC
 - h. 2018-008 Barnacle Goose – WGL
 - i. 2018-044 Hermit Warbler – ACG
 - j. 2018-045 Say's Phoebe – BNC
 - k. 2018-057 Bewick's Wren – JDV
 - l. 2018-058 Bicknell's Thrush – PDP
 - m. 2018-061 Arctic Tern – N/A
 - n. 2018-064 Blue Grosbeak – WGL
 - o. 2018-075 Western Tanager – DAS
 - p. 2018-076 Western Tanager – DAS
 - q. 2018-121 Barn Owl – BAM
10. Division of age/sex/plumage of each record
- a. Amanda to review all records and provide these details
 - i. Will circulate records to Committee that she is unsure of to get general consensus.
 - ii. Deadline: due to Secretary on 21 April 2019
 - iii. Will use 2018 OBRC records spreadsheet to input data

11. Timeline review for Annual Report to meet August issue of *Ontario Birds*
 - a. Mike to circulate first draft to Committee for end of April
12. 2018 Bird of the Year voting
 - a. JDV provided list of 2018 species and rationale of ranking
 - b. Great Kiskadee won out over Reddish Egret by 5 points
13. Election of 2019 committee
 - a. Josh and Paul are completing their terms
 - b. New members (2): 4 excellent candidates were nominated. Josh to contact elected candidates. Top 4 based on member voting:
 - i. Ken Burrell
 - ii. Reuven Martin
 - iii. Mark Read
 - iv. Jeremy Hatt
 - c. Secretary
 - i. Mike Burrell is stepping down.
 - ii. Daniel Riley has volunteered to take on this role
 1. Barb presented motion to nominate Dan Riley; Vote: 7-0. Dan elected.
 - d. Assistant to the Secretary
 - i. Don nominated Barb: Vote: 7-0. Barb elected.
 - e. Chair
 - i. Amanda nominated herself: Vote: 7-0. Amanda elected
 - f. Archivist
 - i. Mike has nominated himself: Vote: 7-0. Mike elected.
14. Group photo by Mark Peck
15. Adjourn: 12:05