

2020 Meeting Minutes

Members present: Amanda Guercio (Chair) [ACG], Adam Timpf [APT], Barbara Charlton (voting member and assistant secretary) [BNC], Mike Burrell (voting member and archivist) [MVB], Mark Read [MDR], Reuven Martin [RDM], Daniel Riley (Secretary) [DJR]

Members not present: Ken Burrell [KGB] (present only for voting on Item 8b)

Agenda:

1. Call to Order – ACG called meeting to order at 0900
2. Minutes of the 2019 OBRC AGM – ACG: motion to approve. Vote: 7-0 in favour.
Minutes of the 2020 Policy Meeting – ACG: motion to approve. Vote: 7-0 in favour.
3. Business arising from 2019 AGM:
 - a. MVB: noted that the timeline of duties has been slightly updated. He will send around the modified version shortly. All of the tasks in the timeline are already covered in the bylaws (at a high level) so no need to add any specific tasks into bylaws. Decision to keep this document as an informal set of guidelines.
 - b. BNC: BNC worked with Don Sutherland from 2019 committee on proposed amendments to 6.2.3 to cover third party submissions: Remove wording in second sentence, saying that can only be submitted with observer permission. BNC: motion to approve – Vote: 7-0.
4. Third round voting: discussion
 - a. 2020-018 Brambling – Members note that they are generally of the opinion that the observer likely saw the identified species, but the evidence provided is not sufficient. Vote: 1-5. Not Accept-ID insufficient evidence.
 - b. 2020-059 Lewis's Woodpecker – MVB: Discussion on reliability of forty year old memory and sparseness of the report. Many members noting that the species is extremely distinctive. Vote: 5-1. Accept.
 - c. 2020-070 Neotropic Cormorant – Discussion on whether size is enough to rule out DCCO particularly a potential runt of the species. Generally determined that the photos and description are not enough to be able to accept this record. Vote: 1-5. Insufficient evidence.
 - d. 2020-098 Sooty Tern – Discussion on whether evidence is sufficient in light of rarity. Members note that the underwing pattern is described well in report. Features identified are generally considered sufficient to rule out potentially similar species including jaegers. Vote: 5-1. Accept.
 - e. 2020-131 Western Sandpiper – Discussion that the submitted photos are not of the same bird. Expert opinions are mixed. Noted that ID of short-billed dull juv WESA vs bright juv SESA is extremely difficult. Vote: 5-1. Accept.
 - f. 2020-145 Black Swift – Evidence is relatively good for species in question. Report does not eliminate other species sufficiently including Common Swift. Vote: 0-6. Insufficient evidence.

- g. 2020-150 Great-tailed Grackle – APT/MVB: Description is sufficient to rule out COGR, BTGR should not be considered due to no recorded pattern of vagrancy. MVB: Notes that timing is good for the species in Ontario. BNC: Notes that the new evidence is the photos provided in the eBird checklist. General comments that the photos are difficult to assess based on their quality. Experts consulted are 1-3 on whether the bird in the photos and described in the eBird checklist can be identified as a Great-tailed Grackle or as a large grackle species (Great-tailed/Boat-tailed Grackle) with 3 of the experts stating that they cannot rule out Common Grackle based on the eBird checklist and photos provided. Members note that although the observer likely saw a Great-tailed Grackle, the evidence provided is not enough to accept a record of this rarity. Vote: 2-4. Insufficient evidence.
Discussion moved to considering the possibility of accepting this record as a Great-tailed/Boat-tailed Grackle. More members are in favour of this, not enough for a consensus and acceptance. Vote held on BTGR/GTGR. Vote: 3-3. Insufficient evidence.
 - h. 2020-176 Spotted Towhee – BNC: No colour described in report. MVB: How can a hybrid be ruled out? APT: Call should be enough to consider it a towhee as the report does not describe the individual in terms other than a towhee with spotting on back. Members note that although they generally believe this species was observed, the evidence provided is not sufficient to rule out a hybrid. Vote: 3-3. Insufficient evidence.
5. Other records to discuss (# of individuals and slash species)
- a. 2020-039 - Cinnamon Teal: Male accepted but we need a consensus on whether the female should be accepted as CITE. Alvaro Jaramillo opinion was the female looks good for CITE. Accept female as well. Vote: 6-0 Accept
 - b. 2020-086 - Ruff: Should we combine with record 2020-085? Very similar pattern, not far apart, but a somewhat large time interval between sightings. MVB notes that during that period we experienced very cold weather which stalled migration for many species. Vote: 6-0 in favour of lumping with 2020-085.
 - c. 2020-089 - Rufous Hummingbird: Decision was insufficient evidence but should this be accepted as *Selasphorus* spp.? Consensus was to use Rufous/Allen's as it is more specific than just the genus level. Vote: 6-0. Accept as Rufous/Allen's Hummingbird
 - d. 2020-113 - Tropical/Couch's Kingbird: Submitted and accepted as the "slash" - should this be left as Tropical/Couch's Kingbird or are committee members comfortable with Tropical Kingbird? Evidence inconclusive to separate. Leave as Tropical/Couch's Kingbird.
 - e. 2020-144 - Ancient Murrelet: There is some disagreement on accepting this as Alcid spp., what should be done with it? Majority opinion that this should just be considered Insufficient evidence.
 - f. 2020-156 - Magnificent Frigatebird: Should this be accepted at frigatebird spp.? Discussion that no optics were used and forked-tail not mentioned. Insufficient evidence.

- g. 2020-168 – Slaty-backed Gull: Should this record be lumped with Peterborough/Muskoka bird? Consensus to keep them as separate since there isn't enough evidence to lump them together.
 - h. 2020-174 - Western Kingbird: Should this be accepted as yellow-bellied kingbird spp.? Discussion that there's enough in the report to rule out Tropical/Couch's, should be considered a Cassin's/Western Kingbird. Accept as Cassin's/Western Kingbird Vote:6-0. Accept.
6. Division of letters of review for insufficient evidence records among voting members
- 2020-001 - Anhinga
 - 2020-002 - Barn Owl
 - 2020-004 - Barnacle Goose
 - 2020-006 - Bicknell's Thrush
 - 2020-007 - Bicknell's Thrush
 - 2020-010 - Black-chinned Hummingbird
 - 2020-032 - Chestnut-collared Longspur
 - 2020-040 - Cinnamon Teal - ACG
 - 2020-041 - Common Eider
 - 2020-051 - Dark-eyed Junco (Gray-headed)
 - 2020-061 - Loggerhead Shrike
 - 2020-083 – Ruff - BNC
 - 2020-088 - Rufous Hummingbird
 - 2020-097 - Slaty-backed Gull
 - 2020-100 - Storm-petrel spp.
 - 2020-108 – Green-tailed Towhee
 - 2020-117 - Western Grebe - BNC
 - 2020-137 - Williamson's Sapsucker
 - 2020-144 - Ancient Murrelet (possibly accept as Alcid spp.)
 - 2020-156 - Magnificent Frigatebird (possibly accept as Frigatebird spp.)
 - 2020-157 - Thick-billed Kingbird
 - 2020-161 - Mississippi Kite
 - 2020-178 - Western Kingbird (possibly accept as yellow-bellied kingbird spp.)
 - 2020-178 - Mississippi Kite
 - 2020-179 - Neotropic Cormorant

ACG will divide the remaining records up between the committee members once the final records list for 2020 is compiled and circulated.

- 7. Division of age/sex/plumage of each record: ACG will do this for all if someone can help with Dickcissels – MVB offered to help with DICKs.
- 8. Motions to add/remove species from review lists:
 - a. KGB/MVB: Presented criteria and list of species to be removed under 3 possible scenarios for south review list. The scenarios are listed in Appendix 1. Of the three possible scenarios, scenario 1 was generally preferred by the committee members during discussion. MVB recommended that Ruff and Western

Sandpiper also be included in Scenario 1 if it were approved since in reality both of those species would pass the five-year threshold had they been on the review list for the whole past ten years. ACG: Motion to approve. Scenario 1: Vote: 7-0, Scenario 2: Vote: 2-4, Scenario 3: Vote: 1-5. Scenario 1 accepted with Western Sandpiper and Ruff added to list of species to be removed.

- b. KGB: Proposed removals from the Central Review List
 - i. Mute Swan, see Appendix 2. Argument that this species is still rare in central Ontario. ACG: motion to approve. Vote: 2-6. Stays on Review list
 - ii. Carolina Wren, see Appendix 3. ACG motion to approve. Vote: 8-0. Off review list
 - iii. Dickcissel, see Appendix 4. ACG motion to approve. Vote: 8-0. Off review list.
- 9. Other agenda items
 - a. BNC: OBRC report deadline(s) and the possibility and advantages of earlier circulation of voting packages. Agreement from all committee members that this is a good approach and will spread the workload out across the year. Quarterly update and call for reports to OFO's Birdnews would be appropriate and matches seasons – MVB to add to timeline document.
 - b. ACG: Transparency in the OBRC, in response to an email to the chair. Good discussion on way the OBRC might attempt to better engage the greater community; consensus was that opening up the discussion on third round voting portion of the AGM would not allow members to be candid with each other but the remainder of the AGM would be fine (maybe not much interest) to open up somehow – although in person might be tricky as “our” room is usually cramped as is. APT: Something for us to try to improve over the next year or so, possibly with new opportunities with updates to OFO/OBRC website.
 - c. ACG: OBRC content on the OFO website
 - i. Ontario checklist, review lists – ACG: website is quite outdated, OFO will be revamping layout, including the OBRC pages. ACG is updating the checklist and can take care of this.
 - ii. Guidelines for reporting – ACG: Quite old and long, critical eye would be helpful to tackle this task. MVB: Suggests that this page should be completely redone. How-to videos might be a good fit for this.
 - iii. Any new pages? None brought up by committee members.
- 10. 2020 Bird of the Year voting.
 - a. Variegated Flycatcher record will be credited with bird of the year, narrowly beating out Tundra Bean-Goose.
- 11. Election of 2019 committee
 - a. ACG and BNC are completing their terms
 - b. 2021 nominees received (6): Christian Artuso, Alvan Buckley, Andrew Keaveney, Dan MacNeal, Michael Olsen, Nicole Richardson
New members (2): 6 excellent candidates were nominated. Amanda to contact elected candidates. Top 4 based on member voting:

OBRC AGM – April 18, 2020

- i. Nicole Richardson
 - ii. Dan MacNeal
 - iii. Alvan Buckley
 - iv. Christian Artuso
 - c. Secretary: 2021 nominees (1): Brett Fried. BNC motion to approve. Vote: 7-0. Accepted.
 - d. Chair: 2021 nominee (1): Mark Read. BNC motion to approve. Vote: 7-0. Accepted.
 - e. Archivist: 2021 nominee (1): Mike Burrell. MVB motion to approve. Vote: 7-0.
12. Adjourn: 11:57

Appendix 1: Proposal: Update the Southern Review List Criteria, prepared by Ken Burrell and Mike Burrell.

Current By-Laws

6.2.4.1. South Review List – As a guideline, species on the South Review List are recorded less than 20 times per five year period on average. For irruptive species that exceed this total in a single year, they must be recorded in at least three of the five years in the period. Any species that clearly exceeds this number in a five year period but lacks proper documentation for the records may be deleted from the list at the discretion of the committee.

Proposed Changes:

Scenario 1.

As a guideline, species on the South Review List are recorded less than the following tiered approach:

- 20 times per five year period, 30 times per 10 year period, or 40 records per 20 year period.

For irruptive species that exceed this total in a single year, they must be recorded in at least three of the five years in the period. Any species that clearly exceeds this number in a five year period but lacks proper document for the, may be deleted from the list at the discretion of the committee.

Scenario 2:

As a guideline, species on the South Review List are recorded less than the following tiered approach:

- 15 times per five year period, 25 times per 10 year period, or 40 records per 20 year period.

For irruptive species that exceed this total in a single year, they must be recorded in at least three of the five years in the period. Any species that clearly exceeds this number in a five year period but lacks proper document for the, may be deleted from the list at the discretion of the committee.

OBRC AGM – April 18, 2020

Scenario 3:

As a guideline, species on the South Review List are recorded less than the following tiered approach:

- 15 times per five year period, 20 times per 10 year period, or 30 records per 20 year period.

For irruptive species that exceed this total in a single year, they must be recorded in at least three of the five years in the period. Any species that clearly exceeds this number in a five year period but lacks proper document for the, may be deleted from the list at the discretion of the committee.

Species which would meet criteria for removal under each proposed scenario (immediately)

Scenario 1 (20/5, 30/10, 40/20)	Scenario 2 (15/5, 25/10, 40/20)	Scenario 3 (15/5, 20/10, 30/20)
Western Grebe (42/20)	Western Grebe (16/5, 27/10, 42/20)	Western Grebe (16/5, 27/10, 42/20)
Mississippi Kite (41/20)	Ruff (19/5)	Chuck-will's-widow (22/10, 31/20)
Western Kingbird (21/5)	Western Sandpiper (15/5)	Ruff (19/5)
Cave Swallow (58/20)	Slaty-backed Gull (15/5)	Western Sandpiper (15/5)
Henslow's Sparrow (42/20)	Neotropic Cormorant (26/10)	California Gull (38/20)
Blue Grosbeak (48/20)	Mississippi Kite (28/10, 41/20)	Slaty-backed Gull (15/5, 20/10)
Species Added in OBRC AGM: Ruff (19/5)	Western Kingbird (21/5) Cave Swallow (58/20)	Neotropic Cormorant (26/10) Little Blue Heron (37/20)
Western Sandpiper (15/5)	Henslow's Sparrow (27/10, 42/20) Blue Grosbeak (48/20)	Mississippi Kite (28/10, 41/20) Western Kingbird (21/5) Cave Swallow (58/20)
		Henslow's Sparrow (27/10, 42/20) Blue Grosbeak (24/10, 48/20)

OBRC AGM – April 18, 2020

Appendix 2: Mute Swan records from Central Review Zone from 2017-2020 prepared by Ken Burrell and Mike Burrell

Date	Date End	Location	Notes
30 May 2017	13 June 2017	Porcupine Lake	Accepted by OBRC
14 July 2017	15 July 2017	Dorion Landing	Accepted by OBRC
29-Jun-18	08-Jul-18	Thunder Bay	Accepted by OBRC
19-Aug-18	03-Nov-18	Thunder Bay	Accepted by OBRC
23 October 2020	07 November 2020	Pic River	Accepted by OBRC
26 September 2020	24 October 2020	Earlton	Accepted by OBRC

Total number of records: 6

Appendix 3: Carolina Wren records from Central Review Zone from 2016-2020 prepared by Ken Burrell and Mike Burrell

Carolina Wren records in the Central Zone			
Date	Location	Observers	Notes
09-Jan-17	Thunder Bay	Bill Greaves	Not submitted to OBRC
December 20, 2016 - January 15, 2017	Thunder Bay	Mobs	Not submitted to OBRC
October 26 2017 - November 30, 2017	Thunder Bay	Mobs	Not submitted to OBRC
October 8, 2016 - December 2016	Timiskaming	Serge Gendron	Accepted by OBRC
October 13, 2017 - November 24, 2017	Timiskaming	Serge Gendron, Michael Werner	Accepted by OBRC
August 27, 2018 - October 6, 2018	Timmins	Roxanne Filion	Accepted by OBRC
27-29 July 2019	Timmins	Roxanne Filion	Accepted by OBRC
09 December 2019	Cochrane	Linda Audette	Accepted by OBRC
2020-10-15 to November 14, 2020	Opishing Lake		Accepted by OBRC
13 August 2020	Rainy River		Accepted by OBRC
13 August 2020	Thunder bay		Accepted by OBRC
03 September 2020	Hilliardton Marsh		Accepted by OBRC

Total number of records: 12

Appendix 4: Dickcissel records from Central Review Zone from 2017-2020 prepared by Ken Burrell and Mike Burrell

Dickcissel records in the Central Zone			
Location	Date Start	Date End	Notes
Porcupine, Cochrane	17 May 2017	19 May 2017	Accepted by OBRC
Sistonens Corners, Rainy River	20 May 2017	22 May 2017	Accepted by OBRC
Rainy River, Rainy River	20 June 2017	08 July 2017	Accepted by OBRC, multiple birds
Rainy River, Rainy River	21-Jun-18	29-Jun-18	Accepted by OBRC
Sable Islands, Rainy River	08-Jun-19	08-Jun-19	Accepted by OBRC
Rainy River, Rainy River	09-Jun-19	09-Jun-19	Accepted by OBRC
Thunder Cape Bird Observatory	05-Sep-17	05-Sep-17	Not reviewed by OBRC
Sioux Lookout	04-Jun-18	04-Jun-18	Not reviewed by OBRC
Mclrvine Road, Duluth Junction near Fort Frances, Rainy River District	19 June 2020	19 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
River Road, Rainy River	17 June 2020	15 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Highway 613 North and Rea Road, Lake Wasaw, La Vallee Township	17 June 2020	27 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Burriss Road West/Carpenter Road, Burriss, Rainy River	19 June 2020	27 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
intersection of Sturgeon Creek Road and Angus Road, Shenston, Chapple Township, Rainy River District	20 June 2020	20 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
intersection of Highway 600 and River Road, Dearlock, Rainy River District	30 June 2020	30 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
between 3186–3198 Mather Rd, Shenston, Rainy River District	17 June 2020	17 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
567 Morley Pattullo Road West, Pinewood	17 June 2020	17 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Morley Dilke Road, Pinewood	16 June 2020	09 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC

OBRC AGM – April 18, 2020

Nellie's Dilke Road	17 June 2020	23 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
intersection of Gouliquer Road and Highway 619, Geographic Township of Nelles, Rainy River District	22 June 2020	14 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Corner of Atwood-Worthington Road 1 and Highway 11, Dawson Township, Rainy River District	20 June 2020	20 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Intersection of Atwood-Worthington Road 1 and Byrnes Road, Wood, Dawson Township, Rainy River District	16 June 2020	24 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Blue Road 3 east of Worthington Road 3, Wood, Dawson Township, Rainy River District	21 June 2020	13 August 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Morton Road, Dryden	20 June 2020	04 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Farm Road south of Boy Scout Road, Neebing	11 June 2020	11 August 2020	Accepted by OBRC
McIrvine Road, Fort Frances	06 July 2020	06 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Highway 600 east of Blackhawk Road, Black Hawk	02 July 2020	02 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
Teeple Road	02 July 2020	02 July 2020	Accepted by OBRC
intersection of Worthington Dilke 7 Road and Byrnes/Nelles Dilke Road, Sleeman	25 June 2020	25 June 2020	Accepted by OBRC

Total number of records: 28