

Topic: OBRC 2021 Annual Meeting

Members present: Mark D. Read (chair), Alvan D. Buckley, Reuven D. Martin, Ken G.D. Burrell, Nicole M. Richardson, Mike V.A. Burrell (non-voting secretary and archivist).

Members absent: Adam P. Timpf, Dan J. MacNeal

Agenda:

1. Call to Order – 9:01
2. Approval of Minutes of the 2020 OBRC AGM
 - All in favour; need to correct the date to fix the year.
3. Business arising from 2020 AGM
 - a. MDR: re item 9cii. Website updates still to be completed.
 - No progress, but should be worked on this year.
4. Third round voting: discussion
 - a. 2021-043 – Greylag Goose
 - Should first discuss ID – if 4/5 don't accept ID, then not accept based on ID
 - Short observation. General consensus is there was not enough evidence to say for sure it was a Graylag. Insufficient evidence (0-5-0).
 - b. 2021-059 – Cassin's Vireo
 - Split vote through all rounds leading up to third round.
 - Very hard record – hardest of the year. Superb documentation and expert opinion.
 - MDR: not 100% agreement from experts.
 - There was some discussion towards a previously submitted report for Ontario.
 - NMR: very subjective ID, essentially hinging on different shades of colour. Very hard to be 100% on any record outside of core range. Not 100% herself but maybe 95%. Very tricky record.
 - RDM: was a weak yes, probably not in a position to change other's votes.
 - KGB: on the fence. Probably is a species that shows up in the east with some regularity, just is a hard ID to nail down.
 - KGB: what have other eastern accepted records looked like?
 - The members took some time to view some photographic records from elsewhere in the east, some of which (e.g. Maine) are supported with good series of photos.
 - What would a perfect record look like? Need to separate from the dullest BHVI.

- Age – Pyle says hatch year, caution should be used. Very hard species to age even in the hand.
 - Would be nicer to have a wider range of photos/conditions. These photos all look like they were taken in pretty bright sunlight.
 - NY record was a bird that was captured and studied in hand.
 - ADB – suggest starting with the null hypothesis of it being a dull BHVI. Can you say with 95% confidence it isn't a dull BHVI? Doesn't think so.
 - MDR – need for extra caution with it being a potential first for the province.
 - No one felt really strongly (on either side). About as tricky as they come. Remember that even if not accepted, it will be kept on file for future re-review, should more information about separating the two species come to light.
 - Vote: 3-2; insufficient evidence (MDR, ADB voted N-ID)
- c. 2021-091 – Slaty-backed Gull
- MDR: only review records from Ontario. No evidence it was ever seen in Ontario.
 - If it was never seen in Ontario then it should be removed from the record. Everyone agrees.
- d. 2021-115 – Mute Swan
- Everyone agrees it almost certainly was Mute Swans. Is there enough in the (brief) report to accept?
 - ADB – very brief report.
 - MDR – does not feel that the OBRC standard is met.
 - Vote: 0-5; insufficient evidence
5. MDR: Other records to discuss (# of individuals, etc.)
- a. MDR: 2021-163 to 2021-173 – lumping/splitting of Razorbill records.
- MDR tried to group Razorbills as best he could during coversheets
 - 163/164 One day on Amherst (6), Wolfe (8), Howe (10) – close for a flying bird.
 - RDM: “more of a lumper” suggested keeping
 - MVB: prefers splitting, lose some resolution if lumped.
 - KGB: Kingston should have had a high number of birds passing through based on geography
 - NMR: prefers splitting. Probably only documented a small percentage of the birds anyways. Many more undocumented birds likely present.
 - MDR: looking at it from an “event” perspective, with each as a “record”. Does see the value in splitting them out.
 - RDM: either should be really lumping or really splitting. Otherwise just guessing.
 - MVB: should be cautious about lumping unless there is good evidence to do so..

- ADB: with such a large event, there are undoubtedly more individuals. Best to split to better show resolution/magnitude.
- Then how to split? Especially the west end of Lake Ontario?
- Consensus was to split whenever possible.
- MVB gave Black-capped Petrel example where records were split..
- MDR to propose a split of records.

b. MVB: 2021-074, 2021-075 and 2021-076; White-faced Ibis (Norfolk)

- 2021-074: 21 May at Old Cut
- 2021-075: 19-20 May at Breakwater
- 2021-076: 31 May at Breakwater
- Is there enough to say they involved the same bird?
- RDM; probably some overlap, but can't say for sure (that's the way they are now).
- MDR: late May, time of year with lots of movement, lots of habitat.
- KGB: leave as is.
- Everyone agrees.

c. MVB: Northern Gannet (Lake Huron/Lake Erie and Lake Ontario)

- MVB gave an overview of Lk. Ontario records from fall 2021.
 - ADB: lots of examples from Newfoundland in winter - when they are rarer - of individual birds covering lots of ground.
 - MVB: in past we have lumped NOGA records.
 - RDM: either split them all or lump them all.
 - KGB: Would be interesting to see winds on dates when birds were actually seen.
 - NMR: makes sense to lump them; just a single bird
 - Everyone agrees, lump them as a single record.
- MVB gave an overview of Lake Erie/Huron records from fall 2021.
 - J. Holdsworth: compared photos – same feathers missing on Pelee and Lake Huron bird.
 - No overlap on dates.
 - KGB: would prefer to split Lake Huron vs Lake Erie.
 - RDM: not convinced the Lake Huron bird is the same as Lake Erie – damage in wing but that wouldn't necessarily be unusual for a bird blown off course.
 - Consensus: lump Lk. Huron and Lk. Erie as two records (one per lake). Make note that there was some evidence it was the same bird.

- d. 2021-033 & 2021-034 Eurasian Tree Sparrow (Terrace Bay)
 - Two at Terrace Bay 20-22 April and one there 4-9 May.
 - 500 m apart.
 - RDM: should be separate – enough birds showing up along the North Shore.
 - Noted that this is the second record of two birds from the north shore.
 - General consensus was to keep split, given the frequency of reports from the north shore and the relatively long gap in time between sightings.

6. Division of letters of review for insufficient evidence records among voting members.
 - MDR: there is a template ready to go. Writer adjusts the letter, including comments from voting slips. Willing to do them himself. Anyone have personal connections?
 - RDM: do we send letters to records that have a voting result of “origin uncertain”? MVB: no.
 - MDR will do them all.

7. Division of age/sex/plumage of each record
 - Should have some comments through voting rounds. Sometimes there are disagreements in the voting slips. Would anyone want to have a crack at them? Mark will draft first.

8. Mew Gull update/proposals from ADB
 - Looked through 34 previously accepted records. Tried to reclassify to Common or Short-billed. Was able to for most of them. Do we want to vote on any of them?
 - RDM: if previously accepted to subspecies then don't need to vote, but if different or no subspecies then probably should.
 - MVB: we could vote to accept any at subspecies level already.
 - ADB: probably about half are already accepted at the subspecies level.
 - MDR: make more sense to do all at once.
 - ADB to prepare records for voting on by 2022 committee.

9. Updates to Bylaws
 - a. MVB: add policy to force potential firsts for the province to always go to second round. Change 6.4.9.1 to the following:

6.4.9.1. A report is considered "Accepted" if it receives no more than one "Not Accept" vote. For taxa which would represent a first record for the province, the record must go through at least two rounds of voting before it can be accepted.

- RDM: could we add a clause that a member can defer in round 1?
- MVB: could you force firsts to need to be 7-0?
- MDR: likes that option but needs to be flagged as a potential first record.
- MVB proposal: “A report is considered "Accepted" if it receives no more than one "Not Accept" vote. For taxa which would represent a first record for the province, the record will be considered accepted if it receives no "Not Accept" votes in round one or no more than one "Not Accept" votes in subsequent voting rounds.”
- Proposal seconded by MDR.
- Vote: 5-0 (accepted).

b. MDR: for discussion but should we change the way we decide bird of the year, and simply rank instead, while considering rarity and how widely seen the bird was (see agenda item 12).

- Motion withdrawn.

10. Motions to add/remove species from review lists:

a. MVB: Motion to remove Mute Swan from central review zone (see summary of accepted MUSW records in Appendix 1)

- Seconded by RDM.
- All in favour, motion passes. Mute Swan is removed from the central review zone effective January 1, 2022.

b. MVB: exotics/reclassification of records into revised categories? May be postponed until next meeting.

- Short discussion of changing the way the OBRC deals with exotic species and “origin uncertain” records. Gave example of British list and eBird exotic categories (e.g. naturalized, escapee, provisional).
- Everyone agreed it is something for the committee to pursue further.

11. Other agenda items

a. MVB/MDR: proposal to share the spreadsheet of published records publicly on the website (all personal information is removed). It's the file located in the shared drive in the folder 'Records database'.

- Motion, seconded by RDM in favour.
- All in favour.

12. 2021 Bird of the Year voting

At the AGM, the Chair will produce a candidate list of the "top five" birds of the year out of the records accepted by the current year's committee. The Committee will discuss these records and add any they believe were over-looked by the chair. Each member and the Secretary will then score each record as follows: up to 30 points each for North American and Ontario rarity (higher points for increasing rarity) and up to 40 points for how widely seen the bird was (higher points for a widely seen bird). The Secretary will

then tally the results and the bird of the year will be the record with the highest average total score. The bird of the year and its finder(s) will be acknowledged in the annual report.

- MDR as chair, proposed the following records: Groove-billed Ani, Yellow-browed Warbler, MacGillivray's Warbler, Prairie Falcon, Glaucous-winged Gull
- Members filled out their choices.
- Yellow-browed Warbler wins.

13. Election of 2021 committee

- a. Ken Burrell and Reuven Martin are completing their terms
- b. 2022 nominees (5): Amanda Guercio, James Holdsworth, Marcie Jacklin, Michelle Martin, and Justin Peter.
 - The committee discussed the nominees, followed by anonymous ranking. The candidates were ranked as follows:
 1. Amanda Guercio
 2. Michelle Martin
 3. Justin Peter
 4. James Holdsworth
 5. Marcie Jacklin
 - MDR will contact first two candidates to see if they will take the position.
- c. Secretary
 - Anthony Kaduck has self-nominated.
 - All in favour
- d. Assistant to the Secretary
 - To be determined by Anthony
- e. Chair
 - Nicole self-nominated
 - All in favour
- f. Archivist
 - Mike self-nominated
 - All in favour

14. Adjourn

- motion to adjourn (MDR) 11:44

Appendix 1: Mute Swan records from the Central Review zone

RecordID	Location	date start	date end
1983-059	Lake Superior Provincial Park, Algoma	02 September 1982	04 September 1982
1009	Pukaskwa National Park (Pic River mouth), Thunder Bay	30 May 1988	10 June 1988
1994-160	New Liskeard, Timiskaming	04 June 1994	17 September 1994
1994-157	Wawa, Algoma	03 October 1994	09 October 1994
1248	Thunder Bay, Thunder Bay	06 July 1996	29 October 1996
1246	Hurkett Cove, Thunder Bay	18 August 1996	
1246	Hurkett Cove, Thunder Bay	16 September 1997	
1998-96	Manitouwadge (Waikoba Lake), Thunder Bay	circa mid July, 1998	
2007-141	multiple (Oxdrift and Dryden, Kenora)	June, 2006	06 November 2006
2013-046	Terrace Bay, Thunder Bay	21 May 2013	
2017-113	Dorion Landing	14 July 2017	15 July 2017
2018-112	Thunder Bay	29 June 2018	08 July 2018
2018-113	Mission Island	19 August 2018	03 November 2018
2021-111	Wawa	04 July 2020	15 July 2020
2020-162	Earlton	26 September 2020	24 October 2020
2020-067	Pic River	23 October 2020	07 November 2020
2021-113	Nighthawk Lake	29 October 2020	
2021-117	Jackfish Lake	14 June 2021	
2021-112	Wawa	15 June 2021	06 November 2021
2021-116	Terrace Bay	20 July 2021	